

**Port of Seattle  
Office of Equity, Diversity and Inclusion  
Luis Navarro, Director Workforce Development  
Workforce Development Strategic Plan  
Results of Investments Analysis for the Period 2015-2019  
June 25, 2020**

---

## Summary

This analysis of the results of investments made by the Port of Seattle in workforce development for the years 2015 through 2019 is organized by type of result:

- Impact – Number and percent of participants achieving certain quantitative results such as training completion, job placement, hourly wage at placement, job retention, career advancement, and wage progression.
- Influence – Changes in policy, systems, and practice. Examples include polices that place a priority on creation of quality, family wage jobs and equity in employment in port-related sectors; strategic partnerships; tracking and evaluation of longer-term employment outcomes (e.g., job retention, career advancement, and wage progression); and changes in employer practices.
- Leverage – Amount of other funding and resources leveraged.

During this time period, the Port invested a total of \$6,516,090 in workforce development. This breaks down as follows:

- Impact – \$5,640,023 was invested in workforce development programs in aviation, construction, maritime, and K-12 career connected learning, as shown in the table below. The results: 9,824 job placements; 1,442 training completions; and 1,303 youth participating in experiential learning events. An additional \$128,365 was invested in new program planning and development.
- Influence – \$747,702 was invested in strategic partnerships and policy/system change; this is in addition to Port workforce development staff time dedicated to this work. The results: creation of the Regional Trades Partnership made up of regional public owners to develop a pipeline of skilled construction workers to help meet current and future needs driven by Port and other public infrastructure projects; creation of the Youth Maritime Collaborative made up of 20 youth serving organizations to provide youth—with a focus on low-income youth and youth of color—maritime career awareness and career connected learning activities; and middle and high school teacher professional development and curriculum development tied to port-related sectors, in partnership with the Washington Alliance for Better Schools.
- Leverage – Over \$10 million in public and private funding was leveraged to support workforce development efforts in port-related sectors.

**Port of Seattle Workforce Development Results of Investments, 2015-19**

	<b>Investment</b>	<b>Results</b>
<b>Impact</b>	<p>\$5,640,023 for workforce development programs in aviation, construction, maritime, and K-12 career connected learning</p> <p>\$128,365 for new program planning and development (e.g., aviation career pathways)</p>	<p>9,824 job placements</p> <p>1,442 training completions</p> <p>1,303 youth participating in experiential learning events</p>
<b>Influence</b>	\$747,702	<p>Regional Trades Partnership of regional public owners established, and shared roadmap and workforce investment plan developed</p> <p>Youth Maritime Collaborative created and supported</p> <p>Seattle Goodwill youth maritime program created</p> <p>Middle and high school teachers provided professional development and curriculum developed tied to port-related sectors, as part of Washington Alliance for Better Schools</p> <p>Maritime high school feasibility study conducted</p> <p>Core Plus maritime curriculum developed</p>
<b>Leverage</b>	\$10.1 Million	\$10.1 million leveraged to support port-related workforce development efforts; sources included employers, local government, state agencies, private foundations, and workforce development system partners

The following sections of this memo provide more detailed information on the Port’s workforce development investments, broken down by impact, influence, and leverage. For example, in terms of impact, Port investments are broken down by year, sector, and program, with data on outcomes, actual expenditures, and cost per result (e.g., job placement, training completion, etc.).

Included at the end of the memo are two notes: one on the approach used to conduct this results of investments analysis and the other on more rigorous Return on Investment (ROI) analyses and what they require.

Also attached is a more detailed worksheet on investments and results.

## Impact

The Port’s workforce development investments support workforce development programs in the aviation, construction, and maritime sectors. During 2015-19, the Port invested \$5,640,023 in these programs, as shown in the table below:

	2015	2016	2017	2018	2019	Total
<b>Aviation</b>	\$831,614	\$1,007,722	\$1,001,953	\$945,722	\$916,318	\$4,703,329
Airport Employment Center						
Airport Employment Continuity Pool						
Aviation Maintenance Technician Project						
<b>Construction</b>			\$104,584	\$199,836	\$525,576	\$829,996
Diverse Community Outreach and Referral						
Outreach, Training, and Retention						
<b>Maritime</b>		\$8,700	\$20,873	\$22,600	\$14,350	\$66,523
Experiential Events						
<b>K-12 Career Connected Learning</b>					\$40,175	\$40,175
<b>Total</b>	\$831,614	\$1,016,422	\$1,127,410	\$1,168,158	\$1,496,419	\$5,640,023

The Port invested in a mix of workforce development programs, with some representing targeted, short term, and low-cost interventions that produce large numbers of job placements, but at lower wages; and others representing more comprehensive, longer term, and higher cost interventions that produce smaller numbers of job placements, but at higher wages.

The Airport Employment Center—operated under contract by Port Jobs—is an example of a targeted, short term intervention. It connects job seekers to employment opportunities at the airport. Services and supports include job matching/placement, job readiness training, career navigation and counseling, referrals to community resources, and employer services (e.g., job fairs and targeted recruitment). In

2019, the Airport Employment Center helped 2,239 job seekers get jobs at the airport, with an average placement wage of \$16.04/hour. Most of those served were people of color and lived in South Seattle and South King County. The cost per placement: \$370.

The Construction Worker Outreach, Training, and Retention program—with Apprenticeship and Nontraditional Employment for Women (ANEW), the Pacific Northwest Ironworkers and Employers Apprenticeship Trust, and the Urban League of Metropolitan Seattle—is an example of a more comprehensive, longer term intervention. It aims to increase the representation of women, people of color, and those living in economically distressed neighborhoods in the construction trades. Services and supports include outreach, assessment, referral, pre-apprenticeship training, case management, and mentoring and networking. In 2018-19, the program helped place 190 participants in apprenticeships and trades related jobs, with an average placement wage of \$26.21/hour. The cost per placement: \$3,818.

The table below shows some of the workforce development programs funded between 2015 and 2019, their results, the Port’s actual expenditures, and per participant costs:

<b>Airport Employment Center &amp; Airport University Port Jobs</b>					
<b>Outcomes</b>	2015	2016	2017	2018	2019
# registered for E/T (unduplicated)	5,180	6,889	6,119	5,085	4,885
# job placements	1,732	1,661	1,953	2,049	2,239
# hiring employers	75	77	82	89	90
Hourly wage @ placement	\$11.08	\$14.20	\$15.02	\$15.44	\$16.04
# training enrollments	297	346	282	319	247
# training completions	247	300	247	275	198
<b>POS actual expenditures</b>	\$831,614	\$995,222	\$889,453	\$840,722	\$827,818
<b>Cost per job placement</b>	\$480	\$599	\$455	\$410	\$370

<b>Construction Worker Outreach, Training, and Retention ANEW, Ironworkers, Urban League</b>				
<b>Outcomes</b>	2015	2016	2017	2018-2019

# enrolled				206
# training completions				175
# placements				190
Apprenticeship				19
Trades related job				63
Hourly wage @ placement				\$26.21
Retention (3 mos)				142 (75%)
<b>POS actual expenditures</b>				\$725,412
<b>Cost per placement</b>				\$3,818

<b>Construction Trades: Diverse Community Outreach and Referral Partner in Employment, Regional Area Youth Development Organization, Urban League</b>					
<b>Outcomes</b>	2015	2016	2017	2018	2019
# recruited, assessed			73		
# referred			28		
<b>POS actual expenditures</b>			\$104,584		
<b>Cost per referral</b>			\$3,735		

<b>Maritime Experiential Events Sound Experience, Salish Sea, Steamer Virginia V, Seattle Maritime Academy</b>					
<b>Outcomes</b>	2015	2016	2017	2018	2019
# students participating in experiential events		6	98	498	474
<b>POS actual expenditures</b>		\$8,700	\$20,873	\$22,600	\$14,350
<b>Cost per participant</b>		\$1,450	\$213	\$45	\$30

In addition, investments were also made in the planning and development of new workforce development programs. For example, \$128,365 was invested in planning and developing the aviation career pathways project, which aims to help airport workers in entry jobs move into pathway jobs and, at the same time, meet the workforce needs of airport employers. This amount is in addition to Port workforce development staff time dedicated to the project, which involved conceptualizing the project, engaging internal and external partners, managing the work, etc.

Aviation career pathways planning and development included:

- Identifying and mapping out five key aviation career pathways: aircraft and facilities maintenance, ground operations, safety and security, customer service/passenger services, and dining and retail
- Identifying targeted, in-demand pathway and entry jobs
- Convening airport employers to share research findings and get their input
- Gathering information on training programs aligned with targeted aviation career pathway jobs
- Identifying aircraft and facilities maintenance as the first career pathway and aviation maintenance technician as the first pathway job to target
- Convening partners (Port Jobs and South Seattle College) to design an aviation maintenance (AMT) prototype

The AMT prototype was launched in January 2020, with about 20 airport workers in entry jobs such as ramp agents beginning a one quarter AMT onramp course offered onsite at the airport, prior to their enrolling in South Seattle's two-year, FAA-certified AMT program.

Additional aviation career pathways prototypes will be developed, based on the planning and development work done and the AMT prototype model, as called for in the OEDI/workforce development strategic plan.

## **Influence**

The Port's workforce development investments also support efforts to influence broader workforce development policies, systems, and investments as they relate to port-related sectors. During 2015-19, the Port invested \$747,702 in these efforts. This is in addition to Port workforce development staff time dedicated to this work. Examples included:

- Regional Trades Partnership – In addition to Port workforce development staff time dedicated to forging a partnership with regional public owners (e.g., City of Seattle, King County, etc.) and creating a pipeline of skilled construction workers, \$61,962 was invested to facilitate establishment of this partnership and development of a shared roadmap and workforce investment plan. Its four priority goals are to:
  - Expand pathways to apprenticeships

- Align and champion greater workforce diversity
- Strengthen apprentice retention and completion rates
- Share accountability for common outcomes

Partnership efforts have included research to identify labor market demand and equity issues; engagement of construction sector partners and the community to share labor market and apprentice data, best practices, and barriers and opportunities; a joint pilot of and funding for construction worker outreach, training and retention services; and “Race Matters” anti-racism training.

- Youth Maritime Collaborative – \$87,499 was invested to support the establishment of this collaborative of 20 youth serving organizations that promotes maritime career awareness and career connected learning activities, with a focus on low-income youth and youth of color.

The collaborative’s efforts have included securing maritime internship commitments and establishing partnerships with other organizations to support interns, organizing and offering a series of experiential and career connected learning events, delivering equity trainings and follow up support to maritime employers, developing a resource database, and conducting maritime employer outreach.

- Seattle Goodwill Youth Maritime Program – \$12,000 was invested in the development of Seattle Goodwill’s youth maritime program, which prepares high school seniors for maritime careers. Key features are career and college readiness, maritime classes at area colleges, service learning and internships, financial stipends, and support services.
- Washington Alliance for Better Schools – In addition to Port workforce development and other staff time dedicated to support this work (e.g., highlighting port-related career pathways, bringing sector connections to the work, and developing work-based problems), \$22,500 was invested to engage middle and high school teachers in professional development and curriculum development tied to port-related sectors.

In 2018 and 2019, 16 teachers participated in professional development opportunities tied to port-related sectors. It’s estimated that 2,400 students have benefited as a result (150 students per teacher).

- Maritime High School – \$49,999 was invested in studying the feasibility of creating a maritime high school in South Seattle. This included engaging stakeholders (e.g., business and labor leaders, educators, and students) in validating need and developing a strategic plan.
- Core Plus Maritime Curriculum – \$75,000 was invested in the development of a Core Plus curriculum specific to maritime. Core Plus is an established, industry validated, career related STEM based high school learning model that was offered at 30 locations around the state in 2018, with enrollment options available to students from more than 150 high schools.

## **Leverage**

The Port’s workforce development investments also leverage other funding and resources. For 2015-19, the figure was over \$10 million. This included:

- \$4.6 million from Alaska Airlines, Boeing, the Annie E. Casey Foundation, the Workforce Development Council of Seattle-King County, United Way of King County, City of Seattle, King County, and Washington State Department of Social and Health Services (Basic Food Employment and Training) to support the Airport Employment Center and Airport University.
- \$5.2 million from other regional public owners (e.g., City of Seattle, King County, Sound Transit, Washington State Department of Transportation, and City of Tacoma) for aligned investments in construction worker outreach, pre-apprenticeship training, placement, support services, and retention.
- \$300,000 from JP Morgan Chase for Seattle Goodwill’s youth maritime program.

## **Report Notes**

### **Approach**

This analysis of the results of investments made by the Port of Seattle in workforce development involved the following steps:

1. Collecting data on the Port’s actual expenditures for 2015 through 2019 from the Port’s Finance Department, and adding in other, additional costs—for example, rent at the airport, in-kind contributions, and airport parking tied to the Airport Employment Center—to reflect total investment made.
2. Assigning actual expenditures and other, additional costs to specific workforce development efforts and distinguishing between type of result – impact (quantitative results such as training completions and job placements) and influence (changes in policy, systems, and practice).
3. Collecting data and information on the results of workforce development efforts, with sources including Port workforce development program contracts and related progress reports, and Port workforce development staff reports and presentations.
4. Calculating per participant costs for workforce development programs with quantitative results.

### **Return on Investment (ROI) Analyses**

This analysis focuses on results of the Port’s investments in workforce development. A return on investment (ROI) analysis would require greater time, effort, and data, along with resources. ROI analyses take a more in-depth, multi-dimensional, and longer term look at costs and benefits associated with workforce development programs, including costs to and benefits for participants, employers, and the public. Such analyses also include control groups for comparison purposes.



An example of such an analysis is the Washington Workforce Training and Education Coordinating Board’s analysis of apprenticeships, conducted as part of its *2020 Workforce Training Results*:

<b>Indicator</b>	<b>Definition</b>	<b>Results</b>
Employment	Percentage of participants who were employed, as reported to the Employment Security Department during the third quarter after leaving the program.	All 76% Completers 91%
Earnings	Median annualized earnings six to nine months after leaving the program. (Quarterly earnings are the result of hourly wage rates and the number of hours worked in a calendar quarter. To derive annualized earnings, quarterly earnings are multiplied by four.)	All \$62,500 Completers \$86,200
Skills	Percentage of participants who obtained an appropriate credential. (Percentage based on all participants, including those who did not receive training through the program.)	45%
Net Employment Impact	Difference between the employment rate for all participants and the control group of non-participants, measured between two and three years after leaving the program.	Not significant
Net Earnings Impact	Difference between the average annualized earnings for all participants and the control group of non-participants, measured between two and three years after leaving the program.	\$14,600
Participant Return on Public Investment	The ratio of the present values of additional lifetime participant earnings and employee benefits to public costs of the program. Additional lifetime participant earnings and benefits are additional earnings and employee benefits received (minus participant program costs, taxes on added income, and any loss in unemployment insurance benefits), when compared to the non-participant control group.	\$71 to 1
Taxpayer Return on Investment	The ratio of the present values of projected additional lifetime taxes paid by the participant (plus any decrease in unemployment insurance benefits), in comparison to the public costs of the program. Additional taxes are those additional taxes projected to be paid in comparison to the taxes projected to be paid by the non-participant control group. Change in UI benefits is the change in benefits paid to participants compared to the non-participant control group	\$36 to 1

Source: Washington Workforce Training and Education Coordinating Board, *2020 Workforce Training Results*, available at <https://www.wtb.wa.gov/research-reports/workforce-training-results/>

Some resources on ROI analyses are:

Kevin Hollenbeck, "Return on Investment in Workforce Development Programs" (2012), available at [https://research.upjohn.org/cgi/viewcontent.cgi?article=1205&content=up\\_workingpapers](https://research.upjohn.org/cgi/viewcontent.cgi?article=1205&content=up_workingpapers)

Chris King, "Does Workforce Development Work" (2008), available at <https://www.aecf.org/resources/does-workforce-development-work>

Andrew Sum. "ROI from Investing in Workforce Development" (2011), available at [www.caalusa.org/WorkforceROI.pdf](http://www.caalusa.org/WorkforceROI.pdf)

Washington Workforce Training and Education Coordinating Board, *Workforce Training Results* (2020), available at <https://www.wtb.wa.gov/research-reports/workforce-training-results/>